

La Jolla Shores Permit Review Committee Special Meeting Minutes

4:00 p.m. - Wednesday, February 17, 2010

La Jolla Recreation Center, 615 Prospect Street, La Jolla, CA

1. Non-Agenda Public Comment
2. Chair Comments
3. Project Review (see A to B below)

Board members present: Helen Boyden (chair), Tim Lucas, Phil Merten, Michael Morton (left after first item), Betty Morrison, John Schenck.

A. NINKOVIC Residence New Project

- PROJECT NUMBER: 195466
- TYPE OF STRUCTURE: Existing single family residential
- LOCATION: 8902 Nottingham Place
- PLANNER: Tim Daly Ph: 619-446-5356 Email: tdaly@san Diego.gov
& Polonia Majas: 619-446-5394; pmajas@san Diego.gov
- OWNERS REP: Bart M. Smith AIA LEEDap 760-753-2464; b.smith@dznpartners.com
- PROJECT DESCRIPTION: A 1,494 square foot second story addition and remodel to an existing 1853 square foot single family residence on a 0.18 acre site at 8902 Nottingham Place in the SF Zone of La Jolla Shores Planned District within the La Jolla Community Plan, Campus Parking Impact (City)

Seeking: SDP

Owner's rep presentation: This is a two story addition. This house is in the campus parking impact area, so any more that 4 bedrooms would require extra off street parking. An existing room on the first floor has no closets and is having the doors removed so it will not be considered a bedroom, resulting in a total of 4 bedrooms for the house. The city has agreed with this change. New dimensions: 3350 sq ft. total; 28' 2" max height of chimney.

A printout of the colors of the materials was presented Street trees and landscaping elements were presented.

Board questions/comments:

Morton: FAR = .41. Front set back 17.7 feet. Side setbacks 5' & 7.3' – not changing from what exists now. North side bedrooms should be obscured glass.

Merten: North side of the house should step back – in rest of city at the 24' level it should slope back. The LJSPDO talks about the transitions in neighborhoods with second stories. La Jolla Shores Design Manual states that there should be roof form compatibility with neighboring buildings.

Merten raised privacy questions about the rear balconies overlooking the neighbor's yard and windows. He wanted to know about the rear planting. The response from the presenter was that some of the rear planting and trees which presently obscure the neighboring houses will be removed and lawn put in. Due to slope of lots and existing 6' fence at the rear, the neighbor's back yard is lower and not visible from the balconies on the new addition; only the neighbor's roof was visible. It is 30' 9" to rear property line.

Boyden: At this end of the street the houses (even two-story ones) are all lower profile. This house is on an outside curve and side elevations are more visible. Presenter: This is true for the southern elevation which has the one story garage, but the two-story north side is more obscured by adjacent home and trees.

Morton: The north side is flat and needs something. Change of materials? Presenter: trying to take advantage of the existing structure; can't really change the design. Owners: least impact to the neighbors, least visible side to the street.

Lucas: The two-story side has a 5' setback and the adjacent house has only a 5' setback; how would it look in the future if that house was made two story?

Motion: Morton, Second: Merten

Item to be continued: Additional information is requested. Show outline and appropriate dimensions of adjacent houses on the site plan. Show the heights of the adjacent homes on the elevations, in relationship to height of the proposed project. Consider altering the north elevation of the home.

Motion approved: 5-0-1

Approve: Lucas, Merten, Morton, Morrison, Schenck

Oppose:

Abstain: Boyden

After the motion, Michael Morton left the meeting.

B. McClelland Residence – Second Hearing

- PROJECT NUMBER: 195996
- TYPE OF STRUCTURE: Type V, NR
- LOCATION: 8360 La Jolla Shores Drive
- PLANNER: Jeannette Temple; Ph. 619-557-7908; E-mail: jtemple@sandiego.gov
- OWNERS REP: Richard Gombes) Ph. 858-663-2045; E-mail rgombes@san.rr.com
- PROJECT DESCRIPTION: 2nd and 3rd story addition (to 4091 sq ft total) to an existing single family residence on a 0.12 acre site in the SF Zone of La Jolla Shores Planned District. Coastal overlay (non-appealable), Coastal Height Limit, and Residential Tandem Parking Overlay Zones within the La Jolla Community Plan area. (City NOA Info) Also Beach Parking Overlay per Cycle review.
-
- SEEKING: Site Development Permit (SDP) & Coastal Development Permit (CDP)
- Other: This property was issued approval #586174 for Project #163792 on 10/31/2008 (per plans) According to architect e-mail: the previous project that was permitted in 2008 was completed through the foundation & framing stage.

Other notes and motion from first hearing:

-1140 sq feet – orig house. detached garage 438 sq ft; garage now located to front of lot

-After first reconfiguration: 1043 sq ft first floor living area. Garage 438 sq ft.

-Exterior stairs not included in measurements

-open patio 741 sq ft. below second floor included in FAR, other patios not included

Previous action:

Motion Furtek: Second: Schenck

Review project again after second cycle issues have been released by city. There are too many issues identified in first cycles issue that need to be cleared before any vote can be taken.

4-0-0

Approve: Furtek, Morrison, Schenck, Lucas
Oppose: None
Abstain: Boyden.

Presented by: Richard Gombes

There have been no changes since the previous presentation. The house is designed to be three stories but look less bulky by having a steep pitched roof and dormers on the third floor.

There were no public comments, other than those made by the owners and architect. The owners also own the property adjacent on the south side of the house.

Board questions/comments:

Lucas: With the steep pitched roofs and angles, this looks more like a ski chalet, based on the concept drawing presented. This makes it look a bit out of place in the neighborhood, but using a steep roof and dormers at the top has the benefit of making the mass of the house look smaller from the street. The next home to the north is a three story straight-sided Spanish style house that did not step back the third story at all, and it looks massive. It clearly didn't meet the guidelines in the LJS PDO and design manual. This is a better approach from the building envelope standpoint. Had concerns that the north side of the house was too flat and looked bare with just siding. They could consider putting in opaque windows for more light if they wanted.

Merten: Was concerned about the differences in the roof structure compared to the neighbor's houses. In the La Jolla Shores Design Manual it states that that there should be roof form consistency from neighbor to neighbor. This steep-pitched roof along with the smaller front triangular roof features make this appear out of place.

Boyden/Schenck: Question about planting in the front buffer space between the street and the sidewalk.
Response: the city is requiring trees to be planted. During the planting there will be archeological observers in case artifacts are discovered.

Boyden noted that coming from the intersection to the north the houses exhibit the following styles: Original one story design, two story Mediterranean style, two story large block design with flat roof, two story blocky Mediterranean style; this proposed home; one story possibly original design, Mediterranean style, later on a barn like home abutting wide parkway.

Motion: Merten Second: Schenck

Findings can not be made for a SDP because the project does not comply with the general design regulations of the PDO, and the roof elements guidelines of the La Jolla Shores design manual.

Motion failed 2-2-0

Approve: Merten, Schenck

Oppose: Morrison, Lucas

Abstain: Boyden

Motion: Lucas Second: Morrison

Continue item to next Tuesday's regular meeting.

3-1-1

Approve: Morrison, Lucas, Schenck

Oppose: Merten

Abstain: Boyden

Adjournment